Geophysical and Mineralogical Controls on the Rheology of Fracture Slip and Seal Breaching DE-FE0023354

Derek Elsworth, Yi Fang, Chaoyi Wang, Yunzhong Jia, Kyungjae Im, Penn State

Jeffrey Fitts, Catherine Peters, Kasparas Spokas, Princeton

U.S. Department of Energy National Energy Technology Laboratory Mastering the Subsurface Through Technology, Innovation and Collaboration: Carbon Storage and Oil and Natural Gas Technologies Review Meeting

August 1-3, 2017

Presentation Outline

- Benefits
- Project Overview
- Technical Status
 - Premise
 - Observations and Active Experimentation
 - Meso-Scale Observations
 - Appropriate Caprocks
 - Velocity-Stepping Experiments permeability and stability
 - Slide-Hold-Slide Experiments permeability and recurrence
 - Micro-Scale Observations
 - Sintering
 - xCT Imaging
 - Analysis at Micro-Scale
 - Digital Rock Physics (DRP) models permeability and stability
 - Continuum permeability and stiffness
- Accomplishments
- Synergistic Opportunities
- Summary

Benefit to the Program

Addresses:

Area of Interest 1, Geomechanical Research

.....to determine the constraints of whether seals transected by blind faults will fail seismically or aseismically when contacted by increased reservoir pressures including CO_2 and the implications of this rupture on seal breaching and loss of inventory.

Relevance to FOA ("in italics")

This project will provide:

"improved understanding of geomechanical processes and impacts critical to scCO2 injection operations.

This [project specifically] *includes* [and integrates]: *theoretical studies, [and] laboratory, work to:*

(a) evaluate and assess the probability of induced seismicity;

(b) understand, characterize, and measure potential permeability changes from slip along existing faults; and

(c) understand and assess the geomechanical behavior and effects of increased reservoir pressure on fractures, faults, and sealing formations."

This will include.....

Project Overview: Goals and Objectives

Examine geophysical and mineralogical controls of caprocks on:

- Fault slip Stable/unstable or aseismic/seismic
- **Permeability evolution** Sense and magnitude
- Potential for seal breaching Permeability and capillary behavior Including:
- Nature, form and rates of weakening that condition whether fractures and faults fail either seismically or aseismically
- *Nature, form and rates of healing* that define whether fractures may strengthen and then re-fail on multiple successive occasions, and
- *Permeability evolution (enhancement or destruction)* that is driven on fractures as a consequence of these behaviors
- Feedbacks on healing conditioned both by *physical and chemical transformations* and the redistribution of mineral mass driven by fluid transport.

Technical Status & Methodology

Background

- Felt seismicity
 - Stable versus unstable slip
 - Mineralogical controls
 - Geometric (stiffness) controls
- Seal breaching
 - Evolution of permeability and capillarity characteristics

Methodology

- Collect, Synthesize and Characterize Sedimentary Formation Samples (Fitts, Lead)
 - Collect Homogeneous and Mineralogically Complex Sedimentary Rocks (Peters)
 - Sinter Mineral Mixtures to Create Idealized Analogs of Sedimentary Rocks (Fitts)
 - Conduct Baseline Characterization of Natural and Synthetic Caprocks (Fitts)
- Laboratory Experimentation (Elsworth, Lead)
 - Evolution of Fault Rheology and Transport Parameters (Elsworth)
 - 3D Imaging of fault contact area, fault geometry, and mineralogy & textures (Fitts)
 - Modeling for Response and for Caprock Screening (Elsworth, Lead)
 - Digital Rock Physics Modeling of Response (Elsworth)
 - Caprock Screening Heuristics (Peters, Fitts)

Fault Zones as Seals and Pathways

Little Grand Wash Fault, UT



[Patil et al., 2017; after Vrolijk et al., 2005]



[Huppert and Neufeld, Ann. Rev. Fluid Mechs., 2014]



Controls on Permeability Structure



7

Induced Seismicity



[Elsworth et al., Science, 2016]

Subduction Zone Megathrusts and the Full Spectrum of Fault Slip Behavior



Seismic – Aseismic Transition Full Spectrum of Slip Behaviors





$$\begin{split} K_c &= \underbrace{(\sigma_n - p)(a - b)}_{D_c} > \underbrace{G}_{l} = K \\ \text{Promote Aseismic Response: } K_c < K \\ \text{Otherwise Seismic Slip if: } K_c > K \\ \text{Increase: } K_c; (\sigma_n - p); (a - b); l \\ \text{Decrease: } D_c; G \end{split}$$

Recurrence Requires: Healing



[Adapted from C.J. Marone, Pers. Comm., 2017]

Maximum Event Magnitude - Equivalent Porous Medium



Maximum Anticipated Moment Magnitude – M or M_dot? M_{Gross} or M_{Net}? Triggered –vs– Induced?



Maximum Event Magnitude - Penny-Shaped Crack



Nascent Friction-Stability-Permeability Relationships



Observations

- dk/k0 increases with increased brittleness (a-b)<0
- dk/k0 increases with increased frictional strength
- Roles of mineralogy and surface roughness?



Seismicity-Permeability Linkages – Natural Samples



Role of Roughness - Fabricated Fracture Surfaces



3D printed fracture casts with different geometric features

Net Friction and Permeability Evolution



Healing - Necessary Component of the Seismic Cycle



Shear Permeability Enhancement

Shear Induced Permeability Enhancement

- Later stage shear slip + Incremented duration of prior slip \rightarrow Significant permeability enhancement
- Permeability continuously decreases during hold (Pressure solution?)
- Prior slip permeability recovery took 70 minute after slip ⑦, WG #600 grit case
- Permeability increase appears to be linear to slip distance
- The enhancement is least apparent with rougher surface granite (WG #150 grit)



Pressure solution

- Permeability reduction due to pressure solution in all cases seems to follow power law decay $k = k_0 t^{-p}$ with power p =-0.37
- The enhancement can be significant after extremely long (natural scale) holds
- Can this be applied to natural hydraulic systems?



Shear Permeability Enhancement

Magnitude of Permeability Enhancement

<u>Absolute</u> perm increase: rougher granite > smoother granite > shale <u>Normalized</u> perm increase: shale > smoother granite > rougher granite <u>Shear</u> permeability increase with duration of prior hold time for Westerly granites

Shear permeability slightly decreases with prior hold time for Green River shale



Permeability increase $\Delta k (m^2)$

WG #600Grit

15

2×10⁻¹⁵

Stick-Slip Response

Response to Laboratory Earthquakes (Stick Slip)



Frictional-Stability-Permeability and Reaction

Experiments:

- Eagle Ford Shale
- Two fluids:
 - pH 2.5
 - pH 7.8
- xCT Imaging before and after flow



Frictional-Stability-Permeability and Reaction

- 1. Permeability change during compression of fracture coupons.
 - From 250 kPa to 2500-3000 kPa confining pressure.
 - ermeability [m⁻] Compression of porous altered layer leads to lower permeability, likely to due compaction/creation of gauge
- 2. Permeability evolution during first 1.5mm of slip.
 - Permeability does not evolve systematically, likely controlled by unique sample geometries.
 - Maximum permeability increase observed for sample with altered layer and vice versa.



Frictional-Stability-Permeability and Reaction



- Results suggest samples exposed to a pH 2.5 brine that formed an altered layer have a lower coefficient of friction relative to samples exposed to a pH 7.8 brine. We hypothesize this is due to the formation of a gouge layer due to the compaction of the altered layer.

Rate-State Friction: u=ui+(a-b)ln(V/Vi) (Dieterich, 1981)

	0.015 -	pH 2.5	pH 7.8	0.015	pH 2.5	pH 7.8
	0.014			0.014	•	
Rate State	0.013		•	0.013 -		
Estation	0.012			0.012 -	•	: · · · · ·
Friction	0.011			0.011		•
Behavior	웁 0.01			A 0.01 -		
	0.009	+	4	0.009		•
	0.008 -			0.008	•	
	0.007 -			0.007		
	0.006 -			0.006 -		
	0.005	•		0.005		

- Results suggest no clear trend for changes in rate-state friction due to the formation of an altered layer/gouge. This may be due to apparatus resistance influence or unique sample geometries.

Stability-Permeability Relations in Composites/Mixtures



Introduction & Motivation

CO₂ bleached sand stone and silt stone showed lower fracture toughness (Major et al. 2014)





Mineralogy Difference

Unaltered Entrada Sand Stone: quartz rich, minor feldspar and calcite, with hematite coating.

Altered Entrada Sand Stone: hematite coating is dissolved, replaced by goethite, no significant change in quartz, feldspar, and calcite. (Major et al. 2014)



Shear Strength -- Unaltered vs Altered

Evolution of friction at 10 MPa normal stress [other normal stresses (5, 15 MPa) show similar trend].



Slip-Stability - Unaltered versus Altered



Permeability Evolution



Accomplishments to Date

ACCOMPLISHMENTS

- VS and SHS Experiments
 - Mechanisms-based seismicity-permeability evolution RSF-k
 - VS experiments on broad suite of natural and artificial samples
 - Nascent stability-permeability relations (indicate larger stability smaller dk)
 - Important role of healing on perm-cycle confirmed
 - Important role of reactive transport on perm-evolution and potentially on stability
- Imaging
 - Frozen post-test fractures
 - Completed first imaging and segmentation of sheared fractures
- Modeling
 - DRP models for friction and stability gouge compared with mixtures data
 - Enables testing of laboratory data for stability and permeability
 - Extended to CO₂ altered samples
 - Developed RT models for stiffness and permeability evolution of fractures

ONGOING

- Refine Mechanistic Understanding of Behaviors
 - VS stability experiments systematic roles of mineralogy and additionally roughness
 - SHS experiments for healing and recurrence and consequences for multiphase flow
 - Reactive transport properties on sheared fractures
- Integrating modeling and experiments and imaging

Synergistic Opportunities

- <u>TILT.princeton.edu</u>

- Linkages with:
 - Explored broad suite of mineralogies that are applicable to various CO₂ demonstration projects and others
 - Projects exploring field scale response -URLs and field experimentation (Guglielmi, Aix-Marseille & LBNL)
 - Seismicity-permeability correlations
 - Linkages across scales for upscaling
 - LSBB (Carbonate), Tournemire (Shale), Mt Terri (Shale)
 - Imaging in vivo (Dustin Crandall)





Summary

- Rupture of caprocks is a potentially important issue in CCS where:
 - Large overpressures may result from CO₂ injection
 - May result in seismic (felt) or aseismic rupture
 - May result in loss of inventory
- Absent and needed are data/information to constrain:
 - Seismic and aseismic reactivation of faults/fractures distribution of felt/aseismic events?
 - Healing of faults/fractures what are event recurrence intervals?
 - Evolution of multiphase flow and transport properties likelihood of breaching and loss?
- Develop methodologies for:
 - Integration of process measurements and imaging at microcscale
 - Scaling microscale-to-mesoscale via digital rock physics models as a new tool
- Apply to CCS by:
 - Enabling the screening of potential caprock materials for suitability and durability
 - Providing a consistent view of the likelihood and consequences of breached seals on seismic risk and loss of inventory for candidate CO₂ storage reservoirs.

Appendix Following

Appendix

Following

Organization Chart/ Communication Plan



Gantt Chart

SCHEDULE of TASKS and MILESTONES			BP1 Oct 2014 to Sept 2015			BP2 Oct 2015 to Sept 2016			BP3 Oct 2016 to Sept 2017					
	PI		Y1Q2	Y1Q3	Y1Q4	Y2Q1	Y2Q2	Y2Q3	Y2Q4	Y3Q1	Y3Q2	Y3Q3	Y3Q4	
Task 1 Project management and planning	Elsw orth													
Task 2 Collect, synthesize and characterize	Fitts													
sedimentary formation samples														
SubTask 2.1 – Collect Homogeneous and Mineralogically	Peters													
Complex Sedimentary Rocks														
SubTask 2.2 – Sinter Mineral Mixtures to Create(Fitts)	Fitts													
Idealized Analogs of Sedimentary Rocks														
SubTask 2.3 – Conduct Baseline Characterization of	Fitts													
Natural and Synthetic Caprocks (Fitts)														-
Task 3 Laboratory Experimentation	Elsw orth													1
Subtask 3.1 Evolution of Fault Rheology	Elsw orth													
and Transport Parameters														
Subtask 3.2 3D Imaging of fault contact area, fault	Fitts													
geometry, and mineralogy & textures														
Task 4 Modeling for Response and Caprock														1
Screening	Elsw orth													
Subtask 4.1 Digital rock physics of response	Elsw orth													
Subtask 4.2 Caprock screening heuristics	Peters/Fitts													
												_		

Bibliography

- Im, K., Elsworth, D., Marone, C., Leeman, J. (2017) The effect of frictional healing on stick-slip recurrence interval and stress drop: Implications for earthquake scaling. J. Geophys. Res. In revision.
- Im, K., Elsworth, D., Fang, Y. (2017) The influence of pre-slip healing on the evolution of permeability on fractures and faults. Geophys. Res. Lett. Submitted for publication.
- Wang, C., Elsworth, D. (2017) Influence of weakening minerals on the ensemble strength and slip stability of faults. J. Geophys. Res.. Submitted for publication.
- Liu, J., Yao, Y., Liu, D., Elsworth, D. (2017) Experimental evaluation of CO₂ enhanced recovery of adsorbed-gas from shale. Int. J. Coal. Geol. Vol. 179. pp. 211-218. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.coal.2017.06.006</u>
- Fang, Y., Elsworth, D., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Fitts, J.P. (2017) Frictional stability-permeability relationships for fractures in shales. J. Geophys. Res., Vol. 122, pp. 1760-1776. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/2016JB013435</u>
- Fang, Y., Wang, C., Elsworth, D., Ishibashi, T. (2017) Seismicity-permeability coupling in the behaviour of gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothermal energy. Geomech. Geophys Geo-energ. Geo-resour.. Vol. 3, No. 2. pp. 189-198. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s40948-017-0051-9</u>
- Elsworth, D., Spiers, C.J., Niemeijer, A.R. (2016) Understanding induced seismicity. Science 354 (6318) pp. 1380–1381. http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.aal2584
- Sang, G., Elsworth, D., Miao, X., Mao, X., Wang, J. (2016) Numerical study of a stress-dependent triple porosity model for shale gas reservoirs accommodating gas diffusion in kerogen. J. Nat. Gas Sci. and Eng., Vol. 32, pp. 423-438. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jngse.2016.04.044</u>
- Fang, Y., den Hartog, S.A.M., Elsworth, D., Marone, C., Cladouhos, T. (2016) Anomalous distribution of microearthquakes in the Newberry geothermal reservoir: mechanisms and implications. Geothermics. Vol. 63, pp. 62-73. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.geothermics.2015.04.005</u>
- Wang, J., Elsworth, D. (2017) Hydraulic fracturing with leakoff in a sual porosity medium. Proc. 51st US Symposium on Rock Mechanics and Geomechanics. San Francisco. June 25-28.
- Fang, Y., Elsworth, D., Wang, C., Jia, Y. (2017) Can mineralogical composition predict frictional strength, stability and shear permeability evolution of fractures. Proc. 51st US Symposium on Rock Mechanics and Geomechanics. San Francisco. June 25-28.
- Wang, C., Elsworth, D., Liu, K, Fang, Y., Jia, Y. (2017) Weakening effects of microstructural films in CO₂-altered reservoir rocks and caprocks. Proc. 51st US Symposium on Rock Mechanics and Geomechanics. San Francisco. June 25-28.

Bibliography - Presentations

- Elsworth, D. 2017. Deformation and permeability evolution in reservoirs and seals with a focus on well survival. Int. Conf. on Shale Gas Eng. Geomechs. Beijing. July 19-21. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Jia, Y., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Samuelson, J., Marone, C. 2016. Seismicity-permeability coupling in reservoirs and caprocks. 51st U.S. Symposium on Rock Mechanics and Geomechanics, San Francisco. June 25-28. [Keynote]
- Elsworth, D. 2017. Key geomechanics challenges for wasteless recovery of energy and fuels. Int. Workshop on Grand Challenges in Mining Engineering. China University of Mining and Technology, Beijing. June 18. [Invited] and Northeastern University. June 21. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Gan, Q., Marone, C., Connolly, P., Alpern, J., Lu, Y., Culp, B., Im, K.J., Wang, J.H., Zhu, W.C., Liu, J.S., Guglielmi, Y., Li, X., Feng, Z. 2017. Prospects for Gas Fracturing in unconventional reservoirs. Henan Polytechnic University, June 15. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Marone, C. 2017. Seismicity-permeability coupling in reservoirs and caprcks [the good, the bad, and the ugly]. YSRM 2017 4th ISRM Young Scholars' Symposium on Rock Mechanics. May 10-12. Jeju Island, S. Korea. [Keynote] and Chinese Academy of Sciences, Wuhan, May 19. [Invited]
- Im, K.J., Elsworth, D., Fang, Y. 2017. Evolution of permeability through the seismic cycle. YSRM 2017 4th ISRM Young Scholars' Symposium on Rock Mechanics. May 10-12. Jeju Island, S. Korea.
- Wang, C., Elsworth, D., Fang, Y. (2017) Weakening effects of low-friction microstructural films in CO₂-altered reservoir rocks and caprocks. Geol. Soc. Amer. Regional Meeting. Pittsburgh. March 18.
- Elsworth, D., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Marone, C. 2017. Seismicity-permeability coupling in porous and fractured media. Interpore 2017. May 8-11. Rotterdam. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D. 2017. Seismicity-permeability coupling in reservoirs and caprocks. Univ. Texas, Petroleum and Geosystems Engineering. April 24. [Invited]
- Elsworth, D., Gan, Q., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Jia, Y., Pogacnik, J., Taron, J., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Liu, J., Chen (UQ), Zhao, Y., Liu, S., Marone, C., Yao, Y. 2016. Key coupled processes in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothemal energy – the good, the bad, and the ugly. TU/e, Eindhoven. December 22. [Invited].
- Elsworth, D., Gan, Q., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Jia, Y., Pogacnik, J., Taron, J., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Liu, J., Chen (UQ), Zhao, Y., Liu, S., Marone, C., Yao, Y. 2016. Seismicity-permeability coupling in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothemal energy the good, the bad, and the ugly. TNO, Utrecht. December 14. [Invited].
- Elsworth, D. 2016. Experimental and analytical studies of unconventional resource extraction. Int. Res. Centr. for Unconv. Geomechs. and Industry Partnering Innaugural Workshop on Unconventional Resource Extraction. Northeastern University, Shenyang, December 6. [Plenary]
- Elsworth, D., Gan, Q., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Jia, Y., Pogacnik, J., Taron, J., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Liu, J., Chen, Z.W., Zhao, Y., Liu, S., Marone, C., Yao, Y. 2016. Key complex process couplings in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothemal energy – the good, the bad, and the ugly. Third Int. Symp. on Multi-Scale Geomechanics and Geo-Engineering, Tongji University, Shanghai, November 9-12, [Keynote]; Beijing, December 5, [Invited]; NEU, Shenyang, December 7, [Invited].
- Elsworth, D. 2016. Subsurface energy choices towards a sustainable future the good, the bad and the ugly. Sustainability Conference 2016. Utrecht University, Netherlands. October 28. [Keynote]
- Elsworth, D., Gan, Q., Fang, Y., Wang, C., Ishibashi, T., Jia, Y., Pogacnik, J., Taron, J., Guglielmi, Y., Im, K.J., Niemeijer, A., Candela, T., Liu, J., Chen (UQ), Zhao, Y., Liu, S., Marone, C., Yao, Y. 2016. Seismicity-permeability coupling in gas shales, CO₂ storage and deep geothemal energy – the good, the bad, and the ugly. Int. Conf. on Geo-Mechanics, Geo-Energy and Geo-Resources, Melbourne, Australia. September 28-29. [Keynote] & October 5, University of Queensland Distinguished Lecture in Mechanical and Mining Engineering [Invited]
- Elsworth, D. 2016. Some key issues in sustainable recovery of subsurface energy resources. NSF Workshop on Geotechnical Fundamentals in the Face of New World Challenges. Washington, D.C. July 17-19. [Invited]
- Fang, Y., den Hartog, S.A.M., Elsworth, D., Marone, C., Cladouhos, T. (2016) Anomalous distribution of microearthquakes in the Newberry geothermal reservoir: mechanisms and implications. Geothermics. Vol. 63, pp. 62-73. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.geothermics.2015.04.005</u>
- Wang, J., Elsworth, D. (2017) Hydraulic fracturing with leakoff in a sual porosity medium. Proc. 51st US Symposium on Rock Mechanics and Geomechanics. San Francisco. June 25-28.
- Fang, Y., Elsworth, D., Wang, C., Jia, Y. (2017) Can mineralogical composition predict frictional strength, stability and shear permeability evolution of fractures. Proc. 51st US Symposium on Rock Mechanics and Geomechanics. San Francisco. June 25-28.
- Wang, C., Elsworth, D., Liu, K, Fang, Y., Jia, Y. (2017) Weakening effects of microstructural films in CO₂-altered reservoir rocks and caprocks. Proc. 51st US Symposium on Rock O Mechanics and Geomechanics. San Francisco. June 25-28.